



Inclusive pedagogies in music education: a comparative study of music teachers' perspectives from four countries

PAMELA BURNARD

University of Cambridge, UK

STEVE DILLON

Queensland University of Technology, Australia

EVA SÆTHER

Malmö Academy of Music, Sweden

GABRIEL RUSINEK

Universidad Complutense de Madrid, Spain

Abstract

Recognizing the increasing importance of developing inclusive pedagogies in music education, this article offers diverse ways of promoting positive learning experiences and reaching learners who are most at risk of exclusion. The findings reported in this article arise out of a wider comparative research project investigating the pedagogies of music teachers working in challenging contexts. This article highlights one strand of the study involving teacher perspectives from accounts of pedagogy documented through interviews and observations. The complex ways in which teachers achieve 'inclusion' (a term that refers to all children achieving and participating despite challenges stemming from poverty, class, race, religion, linguistic and cultural heritage or gender) in their music classrooms is best understood in connection with the interplay of policies, structures, culture and values specific to schools. This qualitative case study of four teachers from four different countries, Spain, Australia, Sweden and the UK, provides insight on ways of working with young people on the margins of society and ways of creating a learning environment in which students can succeed musically. Accounts offered by these four exceptional music teachers range from particular teacher and school strategies to management practices that promote pupil-pupil relations in and outside the classroom, to the way the school connects with its musical community. The authors ask the challenging question of how inclusive our music pedagogies are and conclude with what we can learn, as practitioners and researchers, from comparative accounts of pedagogy.

Key words

comparative research, inclusion, music teaching and learning, pedagogy, teacher thinking

Introduction

One of the impacts of globalization is that many countries are faced with similar societal changes, most of which manifest themselves as challenges to the classroom in terms of attainment targets, social equality and 'learner disaffection' (a term that refers to disenchantment with learning often related to unsatisfactory and often unhappy school experiences that frequently culminate in truancy and exclusion from school). It is commonly agreed that schools do not meet the needs of all children and that societal challenges make unreasonable expectations of schools to equalize achievements given that education cannot compensate for society (see, for example, Bernstein, 1997; Garner, 1993; MacBeath et al., 2007). There is, however, explicit acknowledgement that music plays a crucial role in promoting 'social exclusion' (a term that refers to all children achieving and participating, despite challenges stemming from poverty, class, race, religion, linguistic and cultural heritage or gender) – since it has the capacity for functioning as aim and means when creating an effective learning environment in multicultural schools (see, for example, Bamford, 2006; Bauer, 2005; Dillon, 2006).

Music teachers working with disaffected learners, particularly in areas where there is risk of 'social exclusion' are confronted with difficulties. But are music teachers sufficiently trained to think of artistic practices as being governed by an inclusive definition of cultural activity and one that incorporates informal everyday creativity as well as more formal cultural activity; to work flexibly with a set of practices within multiple and overlapping sets of discourses, cultural practices and language forms? We know music teachers work in culturally diverse societies and understand the potential of music as a unifying force. It is now widely recognized that music teachers can use their diverse context to develop teaching methods that have relevance to all learners (Jeffery, 2005). We read in the literature that the crucial element here is that when teachers discuss the means of improving difficult behaviour, they place themselves centrally in the picture, attributing responsibility for improvement to themselves (Watkins, Mauthner, Hewitt, Epstein, & Leonard, 2007).

This article – which arises from a larger study that began with discussions at the International Society for Music Education (ISME) 2004 Conference in Tenerife and included Bo Wah Leung (Hong Kong) and Frits Evelein (The Netherlands) in a first stage – sets out to describe and compare the practices of teachers working in challenging contexts. The study focused on the following research questions, linked to the aims of this article, which are to:

1. describe what constitutes pedagogies of inclusion as characterized by four teachers working in different multicultural school contexts;
2. compare specific themes concerned with what teachers say and do as they encounter same, similar and different ways of conceiving and coping with challenging contexts;
3. reflect on the problems and benefits of comparative research for music education.

Methodology and methods

This was a small-scale study involving collaboration between four university lecturer-researchers. The methodology was qualitative and the design principle was multiple case study. Whilst case reporting recognizes the complexity of social contexts, the kind of generalization offered is from case-bound features of the instance to a multiplicity of

classes (e.g., inclusion by one teacher in one school may tell us about inclusion by other teachers in other schools). Theoretically informed by an interpretivist research paradigm, this style of educational case study acknowledges the culturally embedded nature of teaching and learning.

Data collection involved classroom observation and in-depth individual teacher and learner interviews (the latter participants' perspectives are not a focus of this article). The field notes included detailed depictions of the class activities, conversations, non-verbal and musical events, and classroom climate features. Each individual teacher was interviewed up to four times, using a flexible interview protocol. During the interviews, the participants were asked exploratory questions regarding their beliefs about teaching and learning music, their perceptions of the kind of classroom environment (or context) created by teachers as part of a learner inclusive approach and the teachers' strategies used to translate learning experiences into engagement and achievement for young people for whom relevance is most effectively demonstrated.

Interviews were also conducted using video-stimulated reviews (VSR) of class music lessons. Dialogic video viewing, a powerful tool for educational research and reflection on teaching and learning, involves the review of videotaped lessons by the participants (Tripp, 1993; Walker, 2002). Points in the lesson are identified as significant or key moments or episodes with respect to the focus of a particular study (see Burnard, 2004, for research example of pupil-teacher VSR). Categories of description are derived from the occurrences and phases in the lessons that flag up issues of inclusiveness. Each teacher's classroom under study, from which this research draws its data, involved varying periods ranging from a three-month period (in the UK) to a 12-month period (in Sweden).

In this study, an adapted grounded theory approach to analysis was adopted in order to identify the major elements of the pedagogy that seemed to shape the teachers' practice under investigation and to describe how these elements, as central and pervasive factors, appeared to be related to the students' engagement in classroom activities. Using a combination of Glaser's (1978, 1992) constant comparative approach and Charmaz's (1995) recommendation for coding 'significant events' to include positive events and relived negative events, from which categories emerge, the analysis procedure involved developing highly contextualized descriptors to systematically illustrate the content of the data. Through repeated scrutiny of the initial list of codes, and by merging descriptors, a set of categories emerged from the interviewees' claims that were triangulated with what was observed in the classroom environment.

The present study provides detailed empirical documentation (i.e., accounts) at the classroom level, of teacher inclusion pedagogies in four particular settings where 'effective teaching' is identified as the dynamic that shapes, gives meaning and explains the 'fit' between pedagogy and the positive learning experiences of those being taught (Alexander, 2000). Here, the comparative education context provides a way forward to inform and theorize across these studies of teachers' pedagogies of inclusion. Broadfoot (1999) confirms this with her seminal comparative studies of teachers, teaching and assessment in the UK and France, which have real-world applications and significance.

Why comparative research?

Several assumptions underpin the decision to conduct a comparative study. First, we share the view that we can't possibly understand our own classrooms until we've looked at those of others. Second, we share the view that comparative studies have the potential to uncover the hidden assumptions that underpin what we do (and do well) in our classrooms. Third, it offers alternatives to the ways in which we have always done things.

136 INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MUSIC EDUCATION 26(2)

We are being told that 'comparing how different countries face common challenges can provide the evidence to make the most effective policies to resolve these issues' (Economic and Social Research Council, 2007, p. 13) locally. With the increasing demand for international comparisons, we felt encouraged, as a comparative research team of music researchers, to conduct international research.

Before proceeding to report on themed findings, as exemplified by music teachers in four countries, we need to set the scene for a searching analysis of the use of the term 'inclusion' in policy and practice, first taking a brief look at how this is played out differently within the local contexts.

Setting the scene: defining 'inclusion' and the policy contexts compared

We began the present study with very different starting points politically. In the UK, the inclusion agenda drives policy and practice. In Sweden, inclusion is construed in terms of the policy of compulsory schooling ('A school for all'). In Australia, the challenging questions frame the issue of advocacy. In contrast, Spain builds policy around school drop-out and truancy issues. In practice, what 'inclusion' looks like in schools internationally speaking goes beyond the simple fact of being allowed to participate (i.e., not being excluded).

One theoretical starting point is offered by Fraser's (1997) notion of 'recognition', where remedies to injustices that are of a cultural or symbolic nature are rooted in social patterns of representation, interpretation and communication. The examples of these injustices include (Fraser, 1997, p. 14):

- cultural domination (being subjected to patterns of interpretation and communication that are associated with another culture and are alien and/or hostile to one's own);
- non-recognition (being rendered invisible by means of the authoritative representational, communicative and interpretative practices of one's culture);
- disrespect (being routinely maligned or disparaged in stereotypic public cultural representation and/or everyday life interactions).

As music educators, we know very well the disruptive effects of the 'disengaged' student for whom school music doesn't fit with what counts as 'their' and 'your' music.

At the classroom level, then, the role of inclusive pedagogies in music education, in terms of the opportunity the teacher offers the individual to participate, to be recognized, to engage and to be respected, concerns the degree to which the teacher can engender an inclusive approach to music learning. The challenging questions of how inclusive our music pedagogies are and what it means to teach music effectively in challenging contexts, where young people are most at risk of exclusion, remain issues of great concern to music educators across the world.

The local contexts: a glimpse of national, school and teacher issues

Case studies were carried out in each of the participant countries, in secondary schools placed in regional locations that presented social problems such as poor socioeconomic background, social deprivation, or high numbers of students from ethnic minority groups.

The Swedish, Spanish, Australian and English selected schools presented different characteristics.

Sweden

In Sweden, the implementation of *grundskolan* (compulsory school) in 1962 marks the beginning of 'a school for all' meant as a meeting place for all children in society. This is a central political goal, which has found broad support in society and constitutes a unique system in the international perspective. However, the great satisfaction of having created a common school for all children has been followed by critical questions. Is it achievable? How does it work as a place for learning and development for children and youngsters with different background characteristics? What is the importance of class, gender and ethnicity in this context?

A critical review of Swedish research into the modern school for everyone, covering the last three decades, shows that most research seldom questions the concepts class, gender and ethnicity. Often, school, teaching, subjects, activities, leadership, teacher and student are treated as neutral concepts. Moreover, different research discourses from different periods decides the focus, content and choice of method. The report argues that this neutral position is a threat to qualitative understanding of a school for all, and asks for research about content and didactics, and what conceptions of assignment and students influence or control the teachers' work. Three problematic fields are discussed. These include:

1. We have a school created for other conditions than the current.
2. The teacher is too invisible as a bearer of culture and values.
3. Individuals (not systems) are the focus of research.

The report also states that it is the researchers who decide what are regarded as relevant questions. A widening of the group of researchers could constitute a force for development, and lead to new questions being asked and invisible fields made perceptible (Tallberg Broman, Rubinstein Reich, & Hägerström, 2002).

In the current national governing document for school music in Sweden, the emphasis is on making music together as a basis for experience and learning, and music as a force for individual development. The Swedish music teacher featured in this study works at a school where 25 languages and 35 countries are represented. In his classroom, the Muslim girls play popular music in the bands, just as everyone else. Focus is on cooperation and collaborative teaching.

Spain

Secondary music in Spain is a compulsory subject which, at the time of the study, was characterized by a concept-based curriculum shaped by musicological perspectives of music learning. In the studied school, a group of students that failed all other subjects was highly motivated by a different subject narrative, the preparation of concerts where each class acted as an orchestra. This was an approach that the teacher called 'music for all' and fitted with the local wind band culture.

In an effort to promote social inclusion according to the economic development favoured by the return of democracy in 1978 and the incorporation of Spain to the European Union in 1986, the 1990 reform raised the age of compulsory education from 14 to 16 years old. Seventeen years later, however, 30 percent of the students drop out and many of those that nominally get their certificate of compulsory secondary

138 INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MUSIC EDUCATION 26(2)

education do not undertake any further professional training. These figures show that, despite official intentions, schooling is still not doing enough to help a great number of Spanish young people to find a place in society. Although economic prosperity hides the situation, an increase in the following conflicts in secondary schools is coming to the attention of the public: absenteeism (Rué, 2003), bullying (Defensor del Pueblo, 2006) and failure (Marchesi, 2003). Secondary teachers, insufficiently trained in programmes designed 40 years ago, find it difficult to cope with present-day challenges.

Within this context, the present case study aims at understanding how a music teacher managed to motivate a group of disaffected learners who were failing all other subjects and displaying violent behaviour, and most of whom would drop out at the end of that school year or the next. Secondary music in Spain is a compulsory subject shaped by a concept-based curriculum and a musicological approach, and schools do not provide instrumental tuition. In the observed school, a different subject narrative was highly appreciated both by the students and by the community: the preparation of concerts with chromatic bar tone instruments, with each class acting as an orchestra.

Australia

In Australia, 'social inclusion' is not directly addressed in state and national policy documents but is advanced by policy documents as a point of advocacy. Secondary music, whilst diversely interpreted in each state, is based upon a national curriculum statement through which creating, making and presenting music in past and present contexts form the basis of programmes. The 2006 national review of music education notes 'a difficulty in identifying schools catering specifically for cultural diversity in their music programmes' (Pascoe et al., 2005, p. xii). There is, however, a significant movement in community health called the Health Promoting Schools programme (Lemerle & Stewart, 2004), which involves the creation of community hubs and promotes personal and community resilience as an approach to increasing social inclusion, health and well-being. Several research sites using this social intervention have involved music-making as a means for the development of community and social change (Dillon, 2005; Dillon & Stewart, 2006).

Within this context, the present case study represents a context where the music teacher engages with cultural diversity through a creative contemporary music programme that forges a relationship with the wider community and has a well-established and well-documented effect on social inclusion. Contemporary music is defined in this context as being a syncretic music drawn from a blend of the students' sub-cultural musical values. This means that the musical styles used in classrooms come from a variety of cultural interpretations of popular music. It should be noted here that popular music is the medium of creative interaction and does provide common ground for students (Dillon, 2007a, 2007b; Dreise, personal communication, 2006). This style of music is also a part of how the South Sea Islander and Indigenous communities value and define their identity. Music is seen as a critical factor in the formation of identity and of personal expression in these communities. The approach in Australia is about giving students a means of their own expression in sound rather than 'colonizing' them through a construction of music that is based upon a European framework. This extends to popular music, where what the teacher values as popular music may differ significantly from that of the students, or even, as occurs in Indigenous communities, where the value placed by the Elders on country music and the youths' use of hip-hop may cause tension (Dillon, 2007a).

The case study school context itself is complex. Alongside low socioeconomic factors, which are common to most, are tribal relationships between South Sea Islander groups

such as Samoan, Tongan and Maori groups from New Zealand, there are also Indigenous Aboriginal groups both local to the area and from other parts of the state, and Vietnamese immigrants. Forming a relationship with communities here comes by way of invitation from church leaders and elders in the community and the invitations have been extended to the music teacher here through his relationships with students. School disengagement and low attendance are commonplace. Students are generally defined as being 'at risk' – youth who are at a substantially higher risk for negative outcomes such as substance abuse, teenage pregnancy, crime, violence and academic underachievement because of family, community, social, political, physical and economic conditions.

Three years ago, a programme called Bringing New Styles was implemented in collaboration with the city council, local and national music retail organizations who supplied instruments, and an innovative community music provider called CreActives. Whilst evaluation of this programme was unable to statistically support positive outcomes, qualitative progress was observed (Dillon, 2007a). This programme was documented by a number of means (Dillon, 2007a, 2007b; Dreise, 2006) and has shown enough promise to have funding continue and further support by the community and the partners.

The current music teacher came to the school in year 2 of the programme in only his second year of teaching. He has suggested his turning point came when he 'stopped trying to achieve the state curriculum outcomes and focused on making music with the students which they valued' (Noel, personal communication, 13 December 2006). It was this that led to his more inclusive relationship with the community and the basis of inclusive outcomes. What is significant about this case is, first, how music was used in the process of forging relationships with students and communities and, second, how the teacher's shift in focus from an outcomes-based music pedagogical approach to a meaningful engagement model affected a change in social relations and a perception of a positive affect.

UK

In the UK, 'social inclusion' has become well established as a term accompanying an array of strategies and initiatives designed to improve the life chances of disadvantaged groups, a characteristic of the selected comprehensive secondary school. The cause of disaffection and disengagement in learning by young people has been the object of much research (Harland et al., 2000; Kinder & Harland, 2004; Kinder & Wilkin, 1998).

The meaning of 'social inclusion' can be summarized as including notions of children with Special Education Needs (SEN) in mainstream schools, to children with SEN accessing mainstream curriculum with social and emotional integration. It can refer to all children achieving and participating, despite challenges stemming from poverty, class, race, religion, linguistic and cultural heritage or gender. It can also refer to all children, parents and the community equally achieving and participating in lifelong learning in many forms in and out of school and college (Topping & Maloney, 2005).

The context for discussion and much change has been the agenda of the government initiative *Every child matters* (Department for Children, Schools and Families (DCSF), 1995–2008), which seeks to explore the well-being of children and young people from birth to age 10. The government's aim is for every child, whatever their background or their circumstances, to have the support they need to: be healthy, stay safe, enjoy and achieve, make a positive contribution and achieve economic well-being. This means that the organizations involved with providing services to children – from hospitals and schools, to police and voluntary groups – have teamed up in new ways, sharing information and working together, to protect children and young people from harm and help them achieve what they want in life.

140 INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MUSIC EDUCATION 26(2)

The music teacher featured in this case, a learning mentor who is a highly skilled, charismatic and experienced musician, provides clear opportunities for pupil participation in the decision-making process and has a positive attitude about the learning abilities of all his pupils. He develops an inclusive approach to teaching music. He is known for engaging and capturing the imagination and commitment of a group of young people who have very fragmented and difficult personal circumstances. He is responsible for transforming the school experiences of many pupils who are seen as disruptive and disaffected learners that would usually be excluded, and who are perceived as having special needs by others. He has offered musical and emotional support to all and developed good working relationships (i.e., partnerships) with his pupils, their parents (whose vulnerability, in many cases, is often pronounced) and the inter-agency work within and outside the school. He seems to make it work and is able to motivate the most 'difficult' students differently in relation to music. He appears to meet the needs of the learner. Disaffected and bored learners in other classrooms are engaged in his. How does he persuade them to participate fully? Is it through musical and creative activities that confer on them an alternative status or because the tasks initiate a certain kind of social and musical engagement? These are impressive claims. The picture is a complex one; how can we explain it?

Contextual commonalities

Common to each context are teachers having to cope with disenfranchised learners. In the Swedish context, the issues raised are 'how to handle a group of children with 25 different mother tongues' and 'how to move from majority culture to minority, from thinking "us and them"'. In Australia, a new question is being raised about music as a means of creating common ground between cultures and also seeking to decolonize European culture and 'how teachers might move between multi-cultural, inter-cultural and urban indigenous experiences and values' in the classroom and ideologically (Buber, 1969, p. 104). This is a difficult task when we consider the musical adaptability of South Sea Islanders. Indigenous students, for example, might be intimidated by this and might refuse to participate.

So, there are intricacies and complexities at every turn in this context.

Pedagogies of inclusion as depicted by four music teachers

The main themes reported next concern the kinds of pupil understanding and learning each of these teachers appears to promote or encourage and the challenges they have overcome and deal with on a daily basis in their classrooms. By presenting the three core values and meanings that embody each teacher's practice, and their voiced accounts, we hope to share some aspects of the dynamics manifested in the classroom practices of music teachers working in challenging contexts.

Insights from a music teacher in Sweden

The Swedish teacher has a strong commitment to teach music, but it is not the music per se which has first priority:

it is more a tool to learn all the other. Because I believe that a person that is able to manage the social interplay of our world will survive, no matter if he or she lacks a mark in one or two school subjects.

However, he wants them to learn how to play together, 'that is where the joy of music is'. Most of the time in the classroom is spent making music, music theory is taught through the instruments. Music history is connected to popular music:

if they can see how much of the new music that is produced only to sell ... and the youth culture is more or less built on music, and it is important to know your background to feel secure in your own identity.

The national guidance documents are important to the teacher.

The Swedish teacher wants his students to learn the value of risk taking:

I want them to learn that it is OK to do wrong, that is how you develop, they should learn social interaction, to know how to communicate with different kinds of persons, personal responsibility. To learn that everybody CAN, everyone is not capable to perform with the same standards – but to give up, no, that is not allowed in my classes.

It is almost like a mantra repeated in all actions and lesson planning: engage – you have to act together; you are responsible for your own teaching. The teacher leaves a lot of space for peer learning (that is, opportunities for the students to learn from each other). He also collaborates and builds teams with other teachers at the school. 'My colleagues are linked together in most questions and actions.' He stresses that the working climate at the school is very important: 'If I ever should hesitate to take a new job at another "problematic" school, it would not be because of the students, but because the staff seems disrupted.'

Insights from a music teacher in Spain

Against a common trend in Spanish music education, the teacher believes that making music only in the classroom is not enough. He organizes concerts where each class acts as an orchestra in an approach he calls 'music for all'. To this aim, he sequences effectively the development of rhythmic and melodic reading skills – as a way to foster an autonomous musical learning – and arranges classical, pop and film music to be performed with chromatic bar tone instruments. The pupils choose the repertoire among the arrangements proposed by the teacher, and also what part they play, rotating roles (melody, accompaniment, etc.).

The teacher has a strong commitment to teach music and believes that the students are capable of making quality music with just two 50-minute weekly sessions, and that complex arrangements are better for coping with the diversity of musical abilities and interests among adolescents. The approach is successful and the subject narrative is incorporated by the school culture. It is praised by the students, by other teachers and by the school administrators. The Associate Head Teacher says:

some children that would drop out but are obliged to stay until they are 16, and only get enthusiastic with certain things. Music is one of them. Watching themselves in the concert, doing it well, being applauded ... is a great way of motivation for them.

Interestingly, even disaffected learners, who are failing all subjects, praise the subject narrative and work hard to rehearse for the concerts, in an effort to be included in the school culture. 'When you enter this classroom, you enter the Berlin Philharmonic', says the teacher.

142 INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MUSIC EDUCATION 26(2)

The learning situations are musically authentic. The Head of Studies considered that the pupils were '... the musicians and he is conducting...' and '... they are all doing the same so that the result will be good ...' In this way, instead of the conflicting and sometimes violent attitudes a group of disaffected learners display in all other subjects, in music, they are highly motivated and attained self-regulation.

Insights from a music teacher in Australia

This teacher employs an inclusive approach where he observes how music is expressive to the students and what it means to his students, especially in the light of their non-achievement in academic environments. He provides an experience that builds on their natural aesthetic response to making music. He is passionately committed to providing musical experiences that will transform students and provide positive frameworks for making music.

Cultural difference

[At my school there] is a reticence for anything that smacks of 'effort', thoughtfulness and hard work in terms of schooling, not necessarily in music, and in many other subject areas. So it's a challenging environment to strike that balance. A lot of my music students are Polynesian and part of Polynesian culture is an aural tradition of music where nothing is written down; they just know it.

An embodied pedagogy

So I show them and let them watch my hand or the voicing on the piano rather than write it down for them. That would make more sense to them. It's visual and aural.

Observing intrinsic motivated activity

I open up the music classroom at lunchtime and I let them jam. And they just play. They play what their cousins have taught them, they play what they play at church or what they are listening to. And that's where I can see where the gun musicians are and see that kind of thing. Because there they don't have to do it. They are there because they want to there are no boundaries around it no assessment.

Discovery learning

I try to be a facilitator. They have an opportunity in my classroom to make discoveries and the things I have planned and the activities I have planned for them aid journey of discovery for them, and I expect them to be able to pick up on that themselves. I try to encourage self-direction and that kind of innate sense of discovery that kids have. Putting things in their way that they'll want to pick up.

Group work

I like to encourage small group work, where the more competent musicians can make sure it's a mixed group, where less competent musicians can copy the more competent musicians. Again, some don't have the listening skills, but I really like to encourage small groups where it's less confrontational, more comfortable in a small group than playing out in front of the class.

Insights from a music teacher in the UK

'Inclusive learners require inclusive teachers of music.' This teacher does not feel alone or that it is a solo struggle to meet the needs of his pupils. For this teacher, teaching is not recognized as being a lonely or alternative (poor) profession. He has a strong commitment to teach music:

I believe that young people possess their own unique theories, interpretations and questions, and that they are co-protagonists in their knowledge-building processes. This means that the most important verb in my practice is not to talk, to explain, to transmit, but to listen.

This teacher employs a listening pedagogy:

When you are listening to kids who have given up, who don't find school relevant let alone meaningful, who are more often removed from lessons by teachers for one reason or another, much of the quality of what you are hearing is your effect on them. Your attention, your listening, is that important. Developing a sense of community and belonging among individuals; modelling respect; I am a teacher who these pupils look up to and respect because they know I actually listen to what they've got to say. Not all teachers do this well ... I am not a teacher who yells at pupils. I don't separate between kids and I think I share the same beliefs as them ... I work at being culturally sensitive to the ways they engage with music in and out of school ... I don't make up excuses for them. They are able to learn, to do things and learn as a community.

This teacher takes every opportunity to educate his pupils about the experiences of being part of several communities, race, gender and religion. This is a classroom where 'musical prejudices are not allowed'. He does this through what he calls 'musical socialization' and this is supposed to be a smaller example of the wider world.

So, what kinds of inclusive pedagogies do these teachers appear to promote and encourage? What can these teachers tell us about socially inclusive practices in music education? What is the significance of this for the meaning of music education philosophy in a global sense? What can we learn from cross-cultural understanding among music educators while also noting important national, regional or cultural differences in the ways they approach and make sense of music education practice.

Conclusions

The contexts and cultural frameworks presented here are diverse and complex. The commonality in the relations between the different cultural and institutional contexts and these 'pedagogies of inclusion' is that these teachers are communicating and engaging students in learning through music experience. Students were motivated in music but not in other subjects in the UK, Australia and Spain, but they were also motivated in other subjects in Sweden because the collaborative student-centred approach was shared by all teachers. Here and in the UK, the teachers were complying with the official curriculum, whereas in Australia and Spain, they were teaching *against* the curriculum. Regarding musical repertoires, both in Sweden and the UK the teachers incorporated the students' preferred musical styles; the Spanish teacher allowed his students to choose from

144 INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MUSIC EDUCATION 26(2)

a proposed selection of styles and the Australian teacher acknowledged the musical skills developed informally through exposure to the students' cultures. The common issues seemed not to be, however, compliance with an official curriculum or musical repertoire, but rather that the four teachers:

- were hearing their students, both listening to what they said or trying to interpret their body language;
- had built a subject narrative that was eventually accepted by the students;
- designed meaningful learning experiences that generated intrinsic motivation through musical teamwork and learner agency; and
- displayed clarity and consistency of classroom management, which at the same time facilitated students' self-regulation of behaviour.

But what is it that we can conclude about how teachers successfully address learner/cultural inclusivity in musical learning? Through a comparative analysis of data, it is evident that the values held and strategies employed by the teachers shape their particular subject narrative. There is a potent awareness by each of these teachers of the embodied, transformational nature of music experience from which they co-construct a learning environment where music-making is both meaningful and expressive for all. Whilst in each location the subject narratives are different, the students, the school and the community appear to accept all and create opportunities for all to succeed. The teachers recognize the power of music activity to connect them with students, and its inherent capacity to engage in ways that are relevant and reverent to the learners and the communities in which they live. The challenge seems to lie in the teacher's capacity for recognizing how to strategically (rather than merely tactically) approach music-making experience as a way to build common ground between cultures and community values.

The teacher's relationship with students is equally important, ranging from the discipline of the Spanish teacher/conductor to the more relaxed relationship of the Australian and Swedish teachers, and the musico-social empathy emulated by the English teacher. What is common is the clarity and consistency in musical management and modelling of musical leadership in the classroom. Again, teachers recognize the inherent properties of ensemble music-making to organize and focus experience, and the importance of social meaning to students in the learning process.

What is most apparent in this comparison is the teachers' ability to design learning experiences that recognize intrinsic motivation and learner agency. These qualities of pedagogical practice, in each case, facilitate an extremely productive, meaningful and focused music experience, and forge a relationship between student and teachers of respect and humanity. We must also remember here that these students are from backgrounds where this kind of engagement, behaviour and experience of success are uncommon. It is this recognition of humanity and the inherent qualities of these kinds of musical activity that are our most important findings.

The teachers in this study demonstrate the ability to forge a consonant interpretation of students' verbal, physical and emotional expression, and simultaneously incorporate this into their teaching practice and experience design. What we see here is practical examples of philosopher Martin Buber's (1969) concept of inclusion relationship, which he describes as taking a student into a selection of your life as a musician/music teacher, first recognizing the other's humanity.

When we interpret Buber's description of inclusion, which he reserved for the particular relationship between teacher and student as opposed to an equal and reciprocal 'I-Thou' relationship, we can see how these teachers do just this. They present

themselves as human through their musical practice and recognize the humanity of the 'other' by taking the students into a selection of their musical life as a teacher. This relationship is clearly demonstrated by these teachers and the successful nature of students' engagement in these contexts is evident in the students' music production, and in their behaviour and respect for the teacher.

What these teachers are trying to achieve in their classrooms is to initiate students into a musical discourse where the focus is on meaningful music-making. In most cases, the national and state curricula have been recast with a focus on inclusive social and cultural health and well-being objectives. Yet in doing so, the teachers exceed expectations of institutional guidelines without loss of quality of music learning. In each case, the music-making reflects the music that the communities value. This serves to connect the school with the community and the community with the school. Most importantly, it reinforces the students' place within these communities and affirms their sense of belonging.

Inclusion in each classroom differs with the musical style/genre and community of practice. In the Spanish case, the wind band tradition presents an opportunity to organize and express popular music using Orff instruments in a symphonic social organization. In the UK, composition encourages expression by students and collaborative activity projects imbued with social and cultural meaning. In Sweden and Australia, similarly, the organization frameworks of rock bands composing and doing cover versions combined with the presentational outcomes of performance creates pedagogy of collaborative creative learning and personal expression.

At the core of these pedagogies of inclusion is the recognition that when we engage in music-making collaboratively, the stylistic procedures for making that music provide 'real-world' approaches to making expressive music. It is the inclusivity that shapes the pedagogy. The teacher recognizes this and recognizes the student's intrinsic engagement with this activity and this music.

Primarily what we have learned from this is the importance of a music teacher's ability to recognize the potential for intrinsic engagement presented by musical activity and, more importantly, to match this activity to what the students and their community value as music.

Final reflections

There were a number of challenges faced by researchers in this project, not the least being the separation of contexts in time zones and physical locations. Whilst we began with an analytical framework based around agreed terms in English that would form the basis of our analysis (e.g., pedagogy, classroom discourse, interaction), what occurred was that we interpreted quite differently those terms once applied to data. In this kind of international research, we need to be aware that language carries with it inherent assumptions and that even among the English interpretations, these assumptions can be different. When the ideas are translated, the concepts also present a range of interpretations. Whilst this appeared to make our task of comparison more difficult and perhaps less congruent, it served as a reminder that we take words such as 'pedagogy' for granted. Dictionary definitions vary. One definition describes the word as 'the science of teaching', yet the kind of interpretation presented by these studies might more accurately be described as 'the art of musical learning and musical teaching'.

This research also provides multiple lenses for making sense of extremely diverse contexts, yet the commonality of teachers making music within a community of learners, in

146 INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MUSIC EDUCATION 26(2)

an inclusive way, was discernable. The principal commonality and most cogent insight was the teachers' ability to recognize the intrinsic qualities of the music-making experiences that engage students.

From here, a way forward for future music education research on characterizing pedagogies of inclusion may include:

- collaborations between researchers, teachers, learners and all those involved in and out of school as a community of learners;
- making explicit the relationship among particular forms of music pedagogy, learning discourse and classroom interaction; and
- developing research methods (i.e., ethnomethodology, autoethnography and critical ethnography) that extend the means of musically making the culturally strange familiar for facilitating creative cultural representations of school-community practice in music learners across cultures and settings.

This has been and continues to be a vibrant and exciting project for us as researchers. It challenges our own research practice and questions underlying assumptions about that practice. As researchers who are also engaged with the training of music teachers, we are also conscious of the importance of these insights as we consider what the lessons are that need to be learned by the next generation of music teachers. We also need to ponder the question of whether teachers who can utilize pedagogies of inclusion are born or educated into these ways of teaching. In facing the multiplicity of ways in which learners' musical experiences are shaped – not just by our own music classroom environments and the decisions we make as teachers, but also by the school values, local communities, national policies and political control – the need for developing inclusive pedagogies that are most relevant, and most effective in promoting musical learning, is an imperative. Against the background and interplay of our own classroom (and cultural) contexts at the level of system, school and classrooms, policy, politics and practice, we need to acknowledge what we *can* learn from pedagogies compared across cultures in order to illuminate and understand our existing practices.

It is teachers who, in the end, will change the world of the classroom by under standing it.

(Jean Rudduck (1937–2007), 1999, p. 51).

References

- Alexander, R. (2000). *Culture and pedagogy: International comparisons in primary education*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Bamford, A. (2006). *The wow factor: Global research compendium on the impact of the arts in education*. New York: Waxmann Munster.
- Bauer, E. A. (2005). Response to June Boyce-Tillman, Towards an ecology of music education. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 12(2), 186–188.
- Bernstein, B. (1997). Class pedagogies: Visible and invisible. In A. H. Halsey, Hl. Lauder, P. Brown, & A. Stuart Wells (Eds.), *Education: culture, economy and society* (pp. 134–156). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Broadfoot, P. (1999). Not so much a context, more a way of life? Comparative education in the 1990s. In R. J. Alexander, P. Broadfoot, & D. Phillips (Eds.), *Learning from comparing: New directions in comparative educational research. Volume 1: Contexts, classrooms and outcomes* (pp. 21–32). Oxford: Symposium Books.
- Buber, M. (1969). *Between man and man*. London: Fontana.
- Burnard, P. (2004). Pupil–teacher conceptions and the challenge of learning: lessons from a Year 8 music classroom. *Improving Schools*, 7(1), 23–34.

- Charmaz, K. (1995). Grounded theory. In J.A. Smith, R. Harre, & L. Van Langenhove (Eds.), *Rethinking methods in psychology* (pp. 27–49). London: Sage.
- Defensor del Pueblo. (2006). *Violencia escolar: El maltrato entre iguales en la educación secundaria obligatoria 1999–2006 (Nuevo estudio y actualización del informe 2000)* (School violence: Bullying among peers in compulsory secondary education 1999–2006 (New study and update of the 2000 report)). Madrid: Defensor del Pueblo.
- Department for Children, Schools and Families (DCSF). (1995–2008). *Every child matters: Change for children*. Retrieved 9 January 2006 from www.everychildmatters.gov.uk/
- Dillon, S. (2004). Documenting cases of 'good practice' in music education. *Queensland Journal of Music Education*, 1(1), 23–52.
- Dillon, S. (2005). El profesor de música como gestor cultural (The music teacher as cultural manager). *Revista Electrónica Complutense de Investigación en Educación Musical*, 2(3), pp. 1–10.
- Dillon, S. (2006). Assessing the positive influence of music activities in community development programmes. *Music Education Research*, 8(2), 267–280.
- Dillon, S. (2007a). Maybe we can find some common ground: Indigenous perspectives, a music teachers' story. *Australian Journal of Indigenous Education*, 36 (Supplement), 59–65.
- Dillon, S. (2007b). *Music, meaning and transformation* (Vol. 1). Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Dillon, S., & Stewart, D. (2006). *Songs of resilience. Proceedings of the 27th World Conference of the International Society for Music Education*. Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.
- Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC). (2007). International collaboration in social science research. *Social Sciences News from the Economic and Social Research Council*, 65 (Spring), 8–14.
- Fraser, N. (1997). *Justice interruptus: Critical reflections on the 'post-socialist' condition*. New York and London: Routledge.
- Garner, P. (1993). Exclusions: the challenge to schools. *Support for Learning*, 8(3), 99–103.
- Glaser, B. G. (1978). *Theoretical sensitivity*. Mill Valley, CA: Sociology Press.
- Glaser, B. G. (1992). *Basics of grounded theory analysis: Emergence vs. forcing*. Mills Valley, CA: Sociology Press.
- Harland, J., Kinder, K., Lord, P., Stott, A., Schagen, I., & Haynes, J., with Cusworth, L., White, R., & Paola, R. (2000). *Arts education in secondary schools: Effects and effectiveness*. Slough: The Arts Council of England.
- Jeffery, G. (Ed.). (2005). *The creative college: Building a successful learning culture in the arts*. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham.
- Kinder, K., & Harland, J. (2004). The arts and social inclusion: what's the evidence. *Support for Learning*, 19(2), 52–56.
- Kinder, K., & Wilkin, A. (1998). *With all respect: Reviewing disaffection strategies*. Slough: The Arts Council of England.
- Lemerle, K., & Stewart, D. (2004, 26–30 April). *Health promoting schools: A proposed model for building school social capital and children's resilience*. Paper presented at the 18th World Conference on Health Promotion and Health Education Conference. Melbourne.
- MacBeath, J., Gray, J., Cullen, J., Frost, D., Steward, S., & Swaffield, S. (2007). *Schools on the edge: Responding to challenging circumstances*. London: Paul Chapman.
- Marchesi, A. (2003). *El fracaso escolar en España* (School failure in Spain). Madrid: Fundación Alternativas.
- Pascoe, R., Leong, S., Mackinlay, E., Smith, B., Church, T., & Winterton, A. (2005). *National review of school music education: Augmenting the diminished*. Australian Government Department of Education, Science and Training.
- Rudduck, J. (1999). Teacher practice and the student voice. In M. Lang, J. Olson, H. Hansen, & W. Bunder (Eds.), *Changing schools: Changing practices* (pp. 41–54). Louvain, Belgium: Garant.
- Rué, J. (2003). *El absentismo escolar como reto para la calidad educativa* (Absenteeism as a challenge to educational quality). Madrid: Centro de Investigación y Documentación Educativa – Ministerio de Educación y Ciencia.
- Tallberg Broman, I., Rubinstein Reich, L., & Hågerström, J. (2002). *Likvärdighet i en skola för alla. Historisk bakgrund och kritisk granskning* (Equality in a school for all: Historical background and critical review). Stockholm: Skolverket (The Swedish National Agency for Education).
- Tripp, D. (1993). *Critical incidents in teaching: Developing professional judgement*. London: RoutledgeFalmer.
- Topping, K., & Maloney, S. (2005). Editors' introduction. In K. Topping & S. Maloney (Eds.), *Reader in inclusive education* (pp. 1–15). London: RoutledgeFalmer.
- Walker, R. (2002). Case study, case records and multimedia. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 32(1), 109–27.

148 INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MUSIC EDUCATION 26(2)

Watkins, C. Mauthner, M., Hewitt, R., Epstein, D., & Leonard, D. (2007). School violence, school differences and school discourses. *British Educational Research Journal*, 33(1), 61–75.

Pamela Burnard is a senior lecturer in the Faculty of Education at the University of Cambridge, UK, where she coordinates the MPhil in Educational Research Course, the MPhil in Arts, Culture and Education and supervises PhD students.

Address: University of Cambridge, Faculty of Education, 184 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 2PQ, UK. [email: pab61@cam.ac.uk]

Steve Dillon is a senior lecturer in Music and Sound at Queensland University of Technology Faculty of Creative Industry, Australia. His research focuses upon meaningful engagement with music-making in schools and communities. He is director of the save to DISC (Documenting Innovation in Sound Communities) research project (<http://www.savetodisc.net/>), which examines and documents the qualities and relationships between music, meaning, health and well-being.

Address: Queensland University of Technology, 37 Stanhope Street, Mt Gravatt, Queensland, 4122, Australia. [email: sc.dillon@qut.edu.au]

Eva Sæther is a senior lecturer at the Malmö Academy of Music, where she has been employed since 1988 as a teacher of Music and Society, and Research Methods. Her musical background and point of departure is Swedish folk music, which has served as a platform, for a wide range of activities: development of new courses and projects to serve an intercultural music teacher training, and academic studies.

Address: Malmö Academy of Music, Post Box 8203–20041, Malmö, Sweden, [email: eva.saether@mhm.lu.se]

Gabriel Rusinek teaches undergraduate and graduate courses at the Universidad Complutense de Madrid, where he also coordinates a doctoral program in Music Education and convenes a yearly research seminar (SCIEM). He has presented papers for the Spanish Society for Music Education, the International Society for Music Education, the ISME Music in Schools and Teacher Education Commission, and the Research in Music Education Conference, and given lectures at institutions such as the University of Barcelona Institute of Educational Science, the Valencia Centre for Teacher Training, the Getafe Conservatoire (Madrid), the Polytechnic University of Valencia and the Autonomous University of Santo Domingo. He has published in Spanish journals such as *Eufonía*, *Távira*, *Musiker*, *Doce Notas* and *Aula de Innovación Educativa*. He collaborates in the advisory board of the *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, and is co-editor of the peer reviewed open access research journal *Revista Electrónica Complutense de Investigación en Educación Musical* (www.ucm.es/info/reciem).

Address: Universidad Complutense de Madrid Facultad de Educación, c/Rector Royo Villanova, s/n, 28040 Madrid, Spain. [email: rusinek@edu.ucm.es]

Abstracts***Pédagogies incluses dans l'éducation musicale: une étude comparative des perspectives des professeurs de musique issus de quatre pays***

Identifiant l'importance croissante de développer des pédagogies incluses dans l'éducation musicale, cet article offre des manières différentes de favoriser des expériences d'étude positives et atteindre des étudiants qui sont les plus en danger d'exclusion. Les résultats publiés dans cet article proviennent d'un projet de recherche comparatif plus

large étudiant les pédagogies des professeurs de musique travaillant dans des contextes difficiles. Cet article souligne notamment une partie de l'étude comprenant des opinions des professeurs issues des apports de pédagogie documentés au travers d'entretiens et d'observations. Les manières complexes dont les professeurs réalisent 'l'inclusion' (une terme qui se rapporte à tous les enfants réalisant et participant en dépit de la pauvreté, la classe sociale, la race, la religion, le acquis linguistique et culturel ou le sexe) dans leurs salles de classe de musique sont mieux comprises en liaison avec l'effet des politiques, des structures, de la culture et des valeurs spécifiques aux écoles. C'est une étude de cas, qualitative de quatre professeurs provenant de quatre pays différents: l'Espagne, l'Australie, la Suède et le Royaume-Uni, fournit des solutions sur les conditions de travail des jeunes en marge de la société et les façons de créer un environnement d'apprentissage dans lequel les étudiants peuvent réussir musicalement. Les comptes offerts par ces quatre professeurs de musique exceptionnels s'étendent du professeur particulier aux stratégies d'école, en passant par les procédures de gestion qui favorisent des relations d'élève à élève à l'intérieur et à l'extérieur de la salle de classe, aux relations de l'école avec la communauté musicale. Les auteurs posent la question pertinente de la façon dont l'inclusion nos pédagogies musicales et concluent avec ce que nous pouvons apprendre, comme praticiens et chercheurs, des comparaisons en pédagogie.

Integrierte Pädagogik in der Musikerziehung: Eine vergleichende Studie von Musiklehrern und deren Perspektiven aus vier Ländern.

Nach der Feststellung der immer wichtiger werdenden Entwicklung einer integrierenden musikpädagogischen Erziehung, zeigt dieser Artikel verschiedene Wege auf, wie eine fördernde und positive Lernerfahrung mit Schülern erreicht werden kann, die besonders gefährdet sind ausgegrenzt zu werden. Die Resultate in diesem Artikel ergeben sich aus einem erweiterten Forschungsprojekt, in das die pädagogische Arbeit von Musiklehrern integriert wurde, die in einem herausfordernden Umfeld unterrichten. Dieser Artikel beleuchtet den Teil der Studie, der aus einer pädagogische Zusammenfassung der Lehrerperspektiven besteht, resultierend aus Befragungen und Beobachtungen. Der umfassende Weg den Lehrer benutzen um Integration' (ein Ausdruck der sich auf Kinder bezieht, die am Teilnehmen und Erreichen der Herausforderungen scheitern, herrührend aus Armut, der Klassenzugehörigkeit, Kultur, Rasse, Religion, sprachlicher und kultureller Herkunft und Erbe) in ihrem Musikunterricht zu erreichen, ist am besten zu verstehen im Zusammenspiel mit der Politik, der Struktur, Kultur und den speziellen Werten einer Schule. Diese wertvolle Fallstudie von vier Lehrern aus den vier verschiedenen Ländern, Spanien Australien Schweden und England gibt einen Einblick in mögliche Wege, wie mit Jugendlichen, die am Rande der Gesellschaft stehen, gearbeitet werden kann um ein Lernumfeld zu schaffen, in dem Schüler im Musikunterricht erfolgreich sein können. Zusammenstellungen die von diesen 4 speziellen Musiklehrern zur Verfügung gestellt wurden, reichen von Einzelunterricht und Schulstrategien zu Führungspraktiken die Schüler zu Schüler Beziehungen in und ausserhalb des Klassenzimmers fördern, bis zur Möglichkeit einer Zusammenarbeit mit der Musik in der Gemeinde. Die Autoren stellen die herausfordernde Frage, wie integrativ unsere Musikpädagogik sei, und enden damit, was wir lernen können als Praktiker und Forscher von vergleichenden Pädagogikberichten.

Didácticas inclusivas en educación musical: Un estudio comparativo de las perspectivas de profesores de música de cuatro países

Dada la importancia creciente de desarrollar didácticas inclusivas en educación musical, este artículo muestra diversos enfoques que promueven experiencias de aprendizaje

150 INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MUSIC EDUCATION 26(2)

positivas para llegar a educandos en riesgo de exclusión. Los resultados que se informan provienen de un amplio proyecto de investigación comparada, que analizó las didácticas de profesores de música que trabajan en contextos difíciles. El artículo se basa en la parte del estudio que se centró en las perspectivas de los profesores sobre sus didácticas, documentadas mediante entrevistas y observaciones. 'Inclusión' es un término que se refiere a que los alumnos participen y tengan éxito a pesar de las dificultades provenientes de la pobreza, la clase social, la raza, la religión, la herencia lingüística y cultural, o el género. Se pueden comprender mejor las sofisticadas maneras en las que los profesores consiguen la 'inclusión' en sus aulas de música analizando la interacción de políticas, estructuras, culturas y valores específicos de los centros educativos. Este estudio de casos cualitativo de cuatro profesores en cuatro países diferentes (incluyendo España, Australia, Suecia y el Reino Unido) muestra formas de trabajar con jóvenes que están en los márgenes de la sociedad, y formas de crear entornos de aprendizaje en los que los estudiantes pueden triunfar musicalmente. Las descripciones ofrecidas por estos cuatro profesores de música excepcionales van desde estrategias organizativas que promueven relaciones entre alumnos dentro y fuera del aula, hasta las maneras en que los centros educativos se conectan con sus comunidades musicales. Los autores plantean la provocadora pregunta de cuán inclusivas son nuestras didácticas musicales, y concluyen con un examen de lo que podemos aprender de la descripciones comparadas de didácticas, como profesionales de la enseñanza e investigadores.